

Musica Scotica



Thirteenth Annual Conference

20-21 April 2018

The Tolbooth, Stirling

www.musicascotica.org.uk

Twitter: @musicascotica

#MusScot2018

**Musica Scotica
Thirteenth Annual Conference**

– Programme –

#MusScot2018

Friday, 20 April

2:00-2:30 pm Registration

2:30-4:00 pm Session 1 Chair: Karen McAulay

Aaron MacGregor A “Scots Chaconne”? Division Patterns and Transmission in Scottish Fiddle Music, 1680-1750.

Mary-Jannet Leith From Caledonia to the Capital: James Oswald in London

Gabriela Petrovic Beethoven and Scotland – *25 Scottisch Songs*, Op.108

4:00-4:30 pm Coffee break

4:30-6:00 pm Session 2 Chair: Margaret Mackay

William Lamb The Curious Case of *Chuas-chiùil*: Evidence for Early Musical Semantics?

Sally Garden The Scottish Ballad Tune Collecting of Andrew Blaikie – A Significant New Discovery

Lucy Macrae Dancing with the Divine Hag: Connecting *Cailleach* Lore across Traditional Music, Song, Story and Dance

6:00-7:00 pm Break

7:00-8:30 pm CONCERT

**Students of Traditional Music at the University of Newcastle
and the Royal Conservatoire of Scotland**

Programme to be announced

Saturday, 21 April**9:15-9:30 pm Registration****9:30-11:00 pm Session 3 Chair: Gordon Munro**Margaret McAllister Alexander Campbell MacKenzie's *Pibroch Suite* for Violin and Orchestra, Op. 42 : An AnalysisJohn Purser Gaelic Sources for Ian Whyte and Leonid Massine's Ballet *Donald of the Burthens (Domhnall nan Cual)*

Rosemary Hall "More of an explosion than a revival": Challenging the Narrative of Instrumental Music during the Scottish Folk Music Revival

11:00-11:15 pm Coffee break**11:15-11:30 pm A Tribute to John Maxwell Geddes (1941-2017)** led by Richard McGregor**11:30-12:30 pm Session 4 Chair: Richard McGregor**

Duncan MacLeod Crossing Traditions

Graham Hair Re-configuring Late-Late Romanticism's Culture of Elective Affinities in the Twenty-First Century: Further Remarks in the Context of Preparing *Musica Scotica's Companion to Recent Scottish Music*.**12:30-1:30 pm Lunch****1:30-3:30 pm Session 5 Chair: Elaine Moohan**

Andy Bull Two Scottish Saints – Two Different Lives – Two Similar Offices?

Greta-Mary Hair Revisiting Carlton Thrasher Russell's Observations on Differentia / Antiphon Connections in the Office

Donald W G Lindsay & Elizabeth Ford Using Twenty-first Century Technology to Understand Sixteenth-century Art: The Crathes Castle flute

3:00-3:15 pm Coffee break**3:00-5:00 pm Session 6 Chair: Morag Grant**

Karen MacAulay A brief update on the AHRC network project "Claimed from Stationer's Hall"

Gill French The William Trotter Music Book

Elaine Moohan Hannah Anne and William Stirling: Exchanging Views on their Listening Experiences, 1834-1842

Jane Pettegree Bandstanding in 19th-Century Caithness

5:00 pm-5:30 pm Break**5:30-6:30 pm CONCERT Scottish Voices, directed by Graham Hair**

Programme to be announced.

ABSTRACTS

alphabetically, by author

Andy Bull

Two Scottish Saints – Two Different Lives – Two Similar Offices?

Saints Columba and Kentigern are two of the most prominent saints of Scotland, but their textual afterlives vary considerably. Columba's Life was written by Adomnán, an Abbot of Iona who was within living memory of the saint; Kentigern's Life was written a number of centuries later after his own time. Yet the late 13th- and 14th-century Offices for these saints from the Sprouston Breviary and the Inchcolm Antiphoner share noticeable similarities in their focus on certain elements of both saints' Lives. Using a lens of cultural memory theory, we can use these Offices to peer into what events from a saint's Life were seen as critical moments by their later worshippers. What moments were worthy of distinct commemoration in a chant? And what could be overlooked? Changes in perceptions regarding the importance of certain events, or the needs of the locality in which the Office was created, will have played critical roles in what was put in, and what was left out. I will compare the Glasgow-based Kentigern to the Iona-based Columba noting the historical factors that changed a cult's perception of a saint, and the methods in how the chant for the text was created. By doing this, we can see first-hand how changes in Scottish politics and religion affected the medieval commemoration of saints.

Gill French

The William Trotter Music Book

The William Trotter Music Book is held at the Edinburgh City Library. It was gifted to the Library but the date of accession to the Library is not known. However, according to the librarian it has been in the Library for a long time. It is called the William Trotter Music Book because at the bottom of a page it is signed "William Trotter Whitsome 1780" and on a later page "William Trotter, Eyemouth Lodge, April 1829". The contents of the manuscript consist of 174 fiddle tunes written in various hands. So who was William Trotter? I have researched documents in the Eyemouth Masonic Lodge to try and establish anything about William Trotter and why there are these two dates in the William Trotter Music Book. Also, why the Eyemouth Lodge is specifically mentioned. The pieces in the manuscript give an insight into the type of music that was played at the Lodge during the late 18th and early 19th centuries.

In 2016 a PhD student at the University of Edinburgh died in the second year of her course. Whilst researching music in the large houses of the Scottish Borders in the eighteenth century she came across the William Trotter Music Book. She had visited the Lodge and done some preliminary research into William Trotter. I was asked by her supervisor if I could write up any of her research. Whilst that has not been possible, this paper is dedicated to her.

Sally Garden

The Scottish Ballad Tune Collecting of Andrew Blaikie – A Significant New Discovery

The 1824 manuscript of Scottish ballad tunes gathered by musician-engraver Andrew Blaikie (1774-1841) and gifted by him to Sir Walter Scott, is well known. But a second ballad manuscript of Blaikie's, briefly mentioned by Robert Chambers in his *Popular Rhymes* (1847), and described by eminent ballad scholar Emily Lyle as having "since been lost sight of, if not lost altogether", has now come to light. Given to Chambers by Blaikie's widow, and containing over 70 tunes, the 'missing' manuscript, lost to scholarship for the last 170 years, not only extends our musical understanding of Scots balladry, but raises new and significant research questions which this paper briefly explores.

Graham Hair

Re-configuring Late-Late Romanticism's Culture of Elective Affinities in the Twenty-First Century: Further Remarks in the Context of Preparing Musica Scotica's Companion to Recent Scottish Music

My remarks constitute a further development of ideas first proposed in papers given at Musica Scotica 2008 at the University of Edinburgh, and last year's Musica Scotica conference here in the Stirling Tolbooth.

The final chapter of the *Companion* concerns Scottish music in the first two decades of the 21st century, but centres not on the work of Scottish composers per se, as do all the other contributions to the volume, but on the making of music in these parts the early 21st century. It narrates personal experience of working with numerous performers, and their interaction with numerous Scottish composers and compositions, including but not only my own. This approach in many cases casts a quite different light on recent developments in the Classical Music tradition in these parts from that cast by the writings of other local composers and musicologists. The chapter features performers of this repertoire in four continents, making comparisons also with other works in the repertoire of those same performers.

My title references two celebrated authors. *Elective Affinities* refers to one of the best-known novels (written in 1809) by Johann Wolfgang von Goethe, and "Late-late Romanticism" was the ironic term proposed by American musicologist Leonard Meyer (1918-2007) as a summation of the character of the Classical Tradition in music during the second half of the 20th century: a term whose implications he explored in numerous publications over a period of nearly 50 years: to take a random example, the article "A Pride of Prejudices" published in the journal *Music Theory Spectrum* in the Autumn of 1991. The comments of dozen or more other writers – in musicology, composition, culture, philosophy, history, sociology, economics and other fields – are also considered.

Greta-Mary Hair

Revisiting Carlton Thrasher Russell's Observations on Differentia / Antiphon Connections in the Office

The literature concerning the "differentia" or "Seculorum. Amen." psalm tone ending in the office focuses primarily on its function to provide a musical connection between the end of the psalm — together with its terminating "Gloria Patri"— and the repetition of the antiphon. Cues for these closing antiphons are rarely given in manuscripts. In edited reconstructions of chants, the closing antiphons are editorial. From information gleaned from the writings of three medieval theorists and observations by Carlton Russell (1966), I concluded that the differentiae in the Offices for St Andrew and St Kentigern relate more closely to passages within the antiphons than to the antiphon incipits. However, truncated antiphons were forbidden by John Peckham, Archbishop of Canterbury from 1279-1292. I opted for a "safe" closing antiphon sung in full.

Russell hoped to establish a system, but refrained due to the lack of conformity within his survey. My recent thoughts, understood in the context of the apparent changes in chant performance in the eighth century suggest a shift on the part of the cantor scribes from noting a differentia / antiphon connection at the end of a chant to a preference for a differentia / reciting tone connection in the psalms between the end and the beginning of each psalm verse. That shift is observed in Russell's non-conforming examples. The cantor scribes did not supply two differentiae for office antiphons — one for use within the psalm and one for the closing antiphon.

Rosemary Hall

“More of an explosion than a revival”: Challenging the Narrative of Instrumental Music during Scottish Folk Music Revival

Academics have explored in depth the various motivations and ideologies that propelled the Scottish Folk Music Revival. However, the narrative largely focuses on singers and their songs (see Munro 1996, Livingstone 1999). Why have instrumental music and musicians been hitherto largely overlooked in the greater body of literature? Scholars have explored various reasons behind this. Dowling (2014) suggests that instrumentalists simply are not as vocal as vocalists, whereas some argue that instrumental music did not experience the same revival as song, if it experienced one at all (see Stevenson 2004, Hand 2007). While there is no doubt that instrumental music in Scotland and the musicians playing it changed in the latter half of the twentieth century, how this change fits into the Scottish Folk Music Revival narrative has not hitherto been explored in depth.

This paper will investigate traditional instrumental music during the 1950s through 1980s in the hopes of expanding the Scottish Folk Revival narrative to include instrumental musicians and their music. I will focus on the motivations behind the music, looking at identity, politics, technology, and community, as well as the timeline of the instrumental revival. Drawing from literature and archival material from pre-revival to present time, as well as my own fieldwork undertaken during my ongoing MScR research, this paper will analyse both scholars’ and musicians’ motivations, ideologies, and theories.

In bringing instrumental music into the spotlight, this paper aims to challenge the established revival narrative, finding a place for this music and understanding its path.

William Lamb

The Curious Case of Cluas-chiùil: Evidence for Early Musical Semantics?

In generations past, Gaels had difficulty separating melody from words: “I once mentioned that I thought a neighbour had the air of a song, and the reply was, ‘How could she have the air and not the words?’” (Shaw 1955: 76; cf Freeman 1920-1: xxv). Music and song are also frequently conflated in Gaelic traditional narrative. For instance, when threatened by an evil spirit, a man in one tale sings a prayer and psalm through the Jew’s harp: “dè bha e a’ dèanamh ach a’ gabhail ùrnaigh agus salm air an tromb” (MacDhòmhnaill 1951). A wide range of evidence points to a pervasive cultural tendency to mix instrumental music and song.

This tendency is most apparent in tales of the *cluas-chiùil* (“musical-ear”), the ability to transmit and receive messages through instrumental music (MacDonald 1956). Many of these narratives serve as aetiologies for well-known pipe tunes and dance songs (e.g. “Duntroon’s Salute” and “Thompson’s Dirk”). While the *cluas-chiùil* may be regarded as yet another supernatural trope, these tales – coupled with other evidence – point towards an earlier cognitive configuration of music and song. In this talk, I will suggest that, for pre-modern Gaelic speakers, song – not music – was superordinate (i.e. “music” was a member of the class “song”), and that this configuration is evident as a substratum signal through the corpus of Gaelic instrumental music.

Mary-Jannet Leith

From Caledonia to the Capital: James Oswald in London

This paper will explore the cultural exchange of musical styles and ideas between Scotland and London in the mid eighteenth century, focusing specifically on the activities and compositional output of Crail-born composer and publisher James Oswald, following his move to London in 1741. Recent research has focused primarily on the activities of Scottish composers in their native land, but much remains to be discovered about their level of success in London and further afield. My paper will shed light upon the ways in which Oswald and other Scottish composers and publishers promoted and marketed their Scottish identity in London. It is intriguing to note that

many members of the mysterious society “The Temple of Apollo” (of which Oswald appears to have been a driving force) were of Scottish origin, suggesting the possibility of a distinct “expat” circle in London during this period. It is hoped that, against a background of social and cultural links between London and Scotland, lines of musical communication may be better understood. The paper will espouse a socio-analytical reading of historical sources, incorporating both reception based and practically informed approaches. Focusing specifically on Oswald’s music will also allow for a brief analysis of the popularity of the Scottish musical style in London during Oswald’s London period, 1741-1769 and beyond. Using his *Airs for the Seasons* as a case study, it will be possible to examine his approach of combining distinctive Scottish musical elements with the latest continental compositional styles, producing a unique synthesis which remains compelling to the present day.

Donald W G Lindsay & Elizabeth Ford

Using Twenty-first Century Technology to Understand Sixteenth-century Art: The Crathes Castle flute

The ceiling of the Muses’ Chamber, Crathes Castle, Aberdeenshire, depicts the muses in a consort, each with her associated instrument. Most of the instruments are well-represented, but the flute, which ends in a large flared bell, is both baffling and intriguing. Traditional instrument makers tend to argue that such an instrument is impossible to make, and even if it was possible, would not sound like a flute.

It is, however, possible with the use of computer assisted design and 3D printing. This presentation will explore how this technology was used to recreate a playing bell-ended flute, and what the implications are for further study of instruments in art.

Funding for the project was provided by the Hope Scott Trust.

Margaret McAllister

Alexander Campbell MacKenzie’s Pibroch Suite for Violin and Orchestra, Op. 42: An Analysis

Scottish composer Alexander MacKenzie (1847-1935), with his colleagues Hubert Parry and Charles Villiers Stanford, was a leader of the late nineteenth-century nationalist movement in British music. Mackenzie also had deep connections with the musical traditions of the continent, was a friend to many elite European musicians and wrote books on Franz Liszt and Giuseppe Verdi. He composed ninety works, of which a significant subset have a Scottish character, a distinct element he delighted in cultivating. His composition *Pibroch Suite* Op. 42 for violin and orchestra, was written at the request of Pablo Sarasate, who performed it on tour in Europe, America and Mexico. This substantial composition has not been subjected to scholarly analysis – although it is most certainly a deserving work. It is expertly crafted, full of enigmatic unexpected progressions and transformations. The harmonic elements are seamlessly connected by Mackenzie’s elegant voice-leading, melodic inventiveness and clearly charted form. This paper will offer a formal analysis of the work and a discussion of its particular style.

Aaron McGregor

A “Scots Chaconne”? Division Patterns and Transmission in Scottish Fiddle Music, 1680-1750

From the late seventeenth century onwards, certain sets of divisions on popular tunes and harmonic grounds began to be labelled in Scottish and English sources as being in Scots or “Scotch” style. Most notably in Edinburgh fiddler John McLachlan’s “The Scots Chaconne”, the Scottish element in these pieces is not immediately clear: was this an extension of ideas

surrounding the “Scotch tune” or was there a more nuanced relationship with the treatment of harmonic and melodic patterns? In the first half of the eighteenth century, an influx of Italian music and musicians brought a new range of influences to Scots fiddle music, including violinistic techniques, melodic and harmonic idioms from Italianate violin sonatas. I am interested in the interaction between Italian, English, and Scots division styles, and the ways in which these were separated in musical sources and performance, sometimes within the repertoire of a single violinist. This paper explores the practice of writing and improvising divisions, highlighting several little known sources and giving an overview of a new database of Scottish fiddle manuscripts currently in preparation. It considers the relationship between oral and literate cultures in the transmission and improvisation of divisions, and investigates variation sets as evidence for performance practice across different styles.

Duncan MacLeod ***Crossing Traditions***

As a composer born to Scots parents, I spent a childhood immersed in Scottish folk music, encouraged in part by my father who was a bagpiper. With time away from home focused on the study of classical music my musical upbringing was of two separate worlds. It was not until starting doctoral studies in 2006 that I began to reflect upon musical identity within my creative practice. This prompted me examine ways in which I could consolidate the music of my formative years, that untimely led to synthesising elements of traditional music within my compositions. As such, this paper will focus on a selection of works that draw influence from Scots music that engage a range of traditions from Pibroch through to Gaelic Psalm singing. I will then discuss the wider impact of Scots traditional music upon my practice, highlighting areas such as temperament, that continue to inform my methodology and approach to composition.

Lucy Macrae ***Dancing with the Divine Bag: Connecting cailleach Lore across Traditional Music, Song, Story and Dance***

In Vol. 1 of *Carmina Gadelica* (1928), Alexander Carmichael describes the ritual dance “Cailleach an Dùdain” (Old Woman of the Mill-Dust), an enacted contest between the characters of an old woman and a man in which the man beats the old woman with a stick, laments her death and then brings her back to life. The tune and accompanying song, Carmichael notes, was “played by a piper or a fiddler, or sung as a ‘port-a-bial’ [sic] mouth tune, by a looker-on, or by the performers themselves. The air is quaint and irregular, and the words are curious and archaic” (Carmichael 1928: 206-207). Carmichael’s observations are echoed by other nineteenth century collectors, including Alexander Campbell, J. F. Campbell and Father Allan MacDonald of Eriskay, and it is evident that “Cailleach an Dùdain” was still sung and danced in some form in the Western Isles until well into the twentieth century. The tune, a 6/8 jig, is still popular with tradition musicians today.

Comparing these accounts with intriguing parallel examples from Gaelic oral narrative, this paper will focus on the appearance of the figure of the hag, (*cailleach* in Gaelic), who casts a mighty shadow across the folklore of Scotland and Ireland. In his far-reaching survey of this mythical figure, Ó Cruailaich (1988; 1994/1995; 2003) notes the hag’s presentation in many forms, from war goddess to wilderness personification. As Newton (2011) and Martin (2013) have discussed, seasonal dramas with themes of combat, death and resurrection have much in common with folk dramas found throughout the UK. As a strand of *cailleach* lore is particularly associated with harvest and winter, connections may also be made between “Cailleach an Dùdain” and the renewal and resurrection of seed. This presentation, which will include a performance of the song and the tune on the fiddle, will seek to draw connections between music, song and story which help

further understanding of this complex figure, who has been called “the most tremendous figure in Gaelic myth” (Mackay 1940).

Elaine Moohan

Hannah Anne and William Stirling: Exchanging Views on their Listening Experiences, 1834-1842

The Listening Experience Database is an AHRC-funded project based at the Music Department of The Open University. (<https://led.kmi.open.ac.uk>) It aims to bring together in one place evidence of listening to music from those who are not professional music critics. As one of the co-investigators on this project, I've been looking at documents in the Glasgow City Archives and particularly those of the Stirling-Maxwell family. This paper will provide a brief introduction to the Listening Experience Database before moving on to look at two key figures from the Stirling family, namely Hannah Anne and William.

Hannah Anne Stirling (1816-43) and her brother William (1818-78) received a typical education for those of their social class which included exposure to the Fine Arts. Hannah Anne became an accomplished pianist and William went on to become a leading expert in Spanish art. We can follow their exchange of views on reading, attending concerts, and buying works of art through 141 letters. Both attended concerts as a matter of course but with very different mind-sets: Hannah Anne with her interest in music and playing the piano and harp, and William writing about concerts to address his sister's interest. What is curious about their correspondence is William's determination to please his sister and write about music which he really does not care about saying that performance are “thrown away” on him because of his lack of interest. Yet he manages to provide his sister with insightful comments about the music and performers. Hannah, on the other hand, knowing that William has little interest in music does not describe her own experiences to him even though she is the one with the technical knowledge.

Jane Pettegree

Bandstanding in 19th-Century Caithness

In 1868, a would-be parliamentary candidate in the Caithness county town of Wick enlisted the local militia volunteer brass band – accompanied by stilt-walking “spangled” boys – to promote his campaign. He lost. This incident is part of a taste for brass bands that enlisted support from a wide range of people from different walks of life in the far north in the second half of the 19th century, and which forms a pattern of local music making that shows that Highland musical tastes were not exclusively represented by the bagpipe and fiddle, at least in the county of Caithness. Volunteer Bands provided towns like Thurso and Wick with a means of expressing their developing civic identities. Although part of a male culture of sociable self-improvement, they also provided women in the area with opportunities to show their support through patriotic fund-raising. This talk will explore how these bands expressed a local identity embedded within a wider British national culture, and provided a platform for community music making that crossed gender and class boundaries.

Gabriela Petrovic

Beethoven and Scotland – 25 Scottish Songs, Op.108

In the early 18th century, the court was, besides the church, the primary place of employment and education for most European musicians. Ludwig van Beethoven and many of his contemporaries were raised, educated and socialized in this system. The French Revolution caused a massive disruption to this order: some courts were completely dissolved others consolidated and others remained under a new organisation. This created both opportunities and challenges for musicians

of this generation. Whether it involved a reliance on court patronage, gifts from the nobility, freelancing, or a balance of all three, the nature of a musical career changed dramatically. A central focus of this presentation will be Beethoven's *Scottish Songs* Op. 108, 25 of them. My theme also concerns aspects of social and cultural history throughout this time period in Scotland and Vienna. An increasing internationalisation in both, the activities of musicians and troupes and the repertoire itself, would have consequences in the musical style of Beethoven and his contemporaries. Or not? Let's discuss that.

John Purser

Gaelic Sources for Ian Whyte and Leonid Massine's Ballet *Donald of the Burthens* (*Domhnall nan cual*).

For musicians, Whyte's ballet *Donald of the Burthens* is remembered for the fact that it concludes with Highland bagpipes joining the orchestra for the Finale in a rendering of *The Reel of Tulloch*. This paper will demonstrate that the Highland, and specifically Gaelic influence upon the ballet was all-pervasive, including Massine's revolutionary choreography and Colquhoun and MacBryde's equally ground-breaking sets and costumes.

The paper includes excerpts from an exclusive interview with the ballet's prima ballerina, Dame Beryl Gray, and supports her assertion of Massine's total involvement by identifying the Gaelic source for the scenario and demonstrating that Massine used parts of its English translation for the playbill.